

IMM MOPR-Ex RPS Status

The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

December 14, 2017

Original

Original					Tier I				
	Delaware	Illinois	Maryland	Michigan	New Jersey	North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
the resource is procured in a state mandated program;	x	Χ	x	X	x	X	X	x	x
the research is presented in a state managed program,									
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning					Offshore Wind requirement,				
that both new and existing resources may participate, the requirements of the	Existing get				restriction on				
program are fully objective and transparent, and the program terms do not	additional			Incumbents can	hydroelectric				
include selection criteria that could give preference to new resources, and no indirect means are employed to discriminate against existing capacity;	multipliers based or install date	i ZECs	Offshore wind	receive credit multipliers	facilities of 3 MW or less	X	v	V	v
indirect means are employed to discriminate against existing capacity,	iiistaii uate	ZECS	Olishole willu	muniphers	1622	Х	X	Х	Х
the structure of such program is compatible and non-dissipations are program.									
the structure of such program is competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning: there are at least 10 independent sellers that make offers consisting of price,	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent	10 independent
quantity pairs; the program passes a three pivotal supplier test; and renewable		sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult	sellers are difficult
characteristic(s) is the only screen for participation in program;	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify	to verify
any single state or multi-state auction, if an auction is used by such program,									
whether as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state									
requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, is competitive and non-discriminatory, selects									
resources with lowest offers; and sets the terms of payment for selected	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction	No auction
resources based on clearing prices;	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement
	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to	Difficult to
any bilateral transactions executed by parties in compliance with that program	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive	determine competitive
are deemed competitive and non-discriminatory;	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior	behavior
· ·	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have	Not all states have
such process provide for consistent terms of trade across PJM, including	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms	consistent terms
allowance for imports and exports meeting consistent definition of renewable across all PJM states:	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination	due to REC origination
au ooo aii i oo	ongination -	ongination .	ongination .	ongination -	ongination .	ongalation	ong induori	ogiilation	ongination
	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with	Possible with
transparent, public data on renewable energy credits (REC) prices and quantities will be provided; and	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard	additions to standard
quantities will be provided, and	Statiuatu	Statiuatu	Statiualu	Statiuatu	Statiualu	Statiuatu	Statiualu	Statiuatu	Statiualu

Original	Delaware		Illinois		Maryland	Tier I (Carve Out Michigan	s) New Jersey	North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
	Solar	Solar	Wind	Distributed Generation	Solar	Tier I	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar
the resource is procured in a state mandaled program;	х	х	x	х	х	х	х	х	х	x	х
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning that both new and existing resources may participate, the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent, and the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new resources, and no indirect means are employed to discriminate against existing capacity:	Existing get additional multipliers based on install date	х	х	х	х	Incumbents can receive credit multipliers	х	x	x	х	х
the structure of such program is competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning: there are at least 10 independent sellers that make offers consisting of price, quantity pairs; the program passes a three pivotal supplier test; and renewable characteristic(s) is the only screen for participation in program;	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify	10 independent sellers are difficult to verify
any single state or multi-state auction, if an auction is used by such program, whether as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, is competitive and non-discriminatory, selects resources with lowest offers; and sets the terms of payment for selected resources based on clearing prices;	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement	No auction requirement
any bilateral transactions executed by parties in compliance with that program are deemed competitive and non-discriminatory;	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior	Difficult to determine competitive behavior
such process provide for consistent terms of trade across PJM, including allowance for imports and exports meeting consistent definition of renewable across all PJM states;	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	have consistent terms due to	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination	Not all states have consistent terms due to REC origination
transparent, public data on renewable energy credits (REC) prices and quantities will be provided; and	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard	Possible with additions to standard

Original			Tier II		
	Maryland	New Jersey	North Carolina	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
	T: "	T	Poultry and Swine	T' ''	T: "
	Tier II	Tier II	Waste	Tier II	Tier II
the resource is procured in a state mandated program;	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning that both new and existing resources may participate, the requirements of the					
program are fully objective and transparent, and the program terms do not					Restricts new
include selection criteria that could give preference to new resources, and no					entry, program
indirect means are employed to discriminate against existing capacity;	X	X	Very Specific	X	ends 2020
the structure of such program is competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:					
there are at least 10 independent sellers that make offers consisting of price,	10 independent				
quantity pairs; the program passes a three pivotal supplier test; and renewable	sellers are difficult				
characteristic(s) is the only screen for participation in program;	to verify				
any single state or multi-state auction, if an auction is used by such program,					
whether as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state					
requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, is competitive and non-discriminatory, selects					
resources with lowest offers; and sets the terms of payment for selected	No auction				
resources based on clearing prices;	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement	requirement
	Difficult to				
	determine	determine	determine	determine	determine
any bilateral transactions executed by parties in compliance with that program are deemed competitive and non-discriminatory;	competitive behavior	competitive behavior	competitive behavior	competitive behavior	competitive behavior
are deemed competitive and non-discriminatory,	beliavioi	Deliavioi	Deliavioi	Deliavioi	Deliavioi
		Not all states have			
such process provide for consistent terms of trade across PJM, including	consistent terms				
allowance for imports and exports meeting consistent definition of renewable across all PJM states;	due to REC origination				
auruss aii i Jivi states,	ongination	Origination	Origination	ongination	ongination
	Possible with				
transparent, public data on renewable energy credits (REC) prices and	additions to				
quantities will be provided; and	standard	standard	standard	standard	standard

Revised

Revised					er I				
	Delaware	Illinois	Maryland	Michigan	New Jersey	North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
The terms of the program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:									
the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources,	Х	х	Х	X	х	х	х	х	х
both new and existing renewable resources may participate,	Х	х	х	X	Х	Х	Х	X	x
all suppliers of renewable resources may participate,	х	х	Х	х	х	х	Х	Х	х
the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent,	х	х	х	х	х	х	х	х	х
the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, and	Existing get additional multipliers based on install date	ZECs	Offshore wind	Incumbents can receive credit multipliers	X	x	х	х	X
the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity.	Advantage to incumbent, off-shore get 350%, in v state receive a 10% benefit	x	Offshore wind	Incumbents can receive credit multipliers	Offshore Wind requirement, restriction on hydroelectric facilities of 3 MW or less	X	x	X	х
the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources,	Х	Zero Emission facility's are nuclear power	х	х	X	Combined heat & power	х	х	X
If the program does not use an auction:									
purchase of renewables is at arms length with unaffiliated suppliers,	Х	х	Х	Х	х	Х	Х	х	Х
the price paid for renewable resources is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	х	X	х	х	x	х	х	х	х

If the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:

winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), and

payments to winners based on auction clearing price

at least three nonaffiliated sellers.

Revised	Delaware		Illinois	Tier I	(Carve Outs) Maryland	New Jersey	North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
The terms of the program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:	Solar	Solar	Wind	Distributed Generatio	n Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar
the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources,	e X	х	х	х	Х	х	X	х	х	X
both new and existing renewable resources may participate,	х	Х	Х	х	Х	х	х	х	х	х
all suppliers of renewable resources may participate,	х	Х	Х	Х	Х	х	х	Х	х	х
the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent,	х	х	х	х	Х	x	X	Х	Х	x
the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, and	Existing get additional multipliers based on instal date	х	х	х	х	x	х	х	х	Х
the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity.	х	х	х	X	х	х	Х	х	х	X
the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources,	X	X	X	х	X	х	х	х	X	x
If the program does not use an auction:										
purchase of renewables is at arms length with unaffiliated suppliers,	х	х	х	х	X	х	х	х	х	Х
the price paid for renewable resources is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	x	х	х	х	х	X	х	х	х	X

If the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:

winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), and

payments to winners based on auction clearing price

at least three nonaffiliated sellers.

Revised	Maryland	New Jersey	Tier II North Carolina	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
The terms of the program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:	Tier II	Tier II	Poultry and Swine Waste	Tier II	Tier II
the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources,	Х	X	Х	Х	X
both new and existing renewable resources may participate,	х	X	X	Х	If existing before January 1, 2004
all suppliers of renewable resources may participate,	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х
the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent,	х	Х	Х	Х	х
the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, and	x	x	Very Specific	х	Only old units can participate
the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity.	x	х	х	х	Restricts new entry, program ends 2020
the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources,	x	х	x	Waste coal, coal-mine methane, coal gasification	X
If the program does not use an auction:					
purchase of renewables is at arms length with unaffiliated suppliers,	х	х	X	х	х
the price paid for renewable resources is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	X	Х	Х	Х	x

If the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning:

winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), and

payments to winners based on auction clearing price

at least three nonaffiliated sellers.

Revised – 3

Revised 3	Delaware	Illinois	Maryland	Michigan	Tier I New Jersey	North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC	Vol Indiana	untary Virginia
A Capacity Market Seller may qualify a MOPR Screened Generation Resource for an RPS Exemption in any RPM Auction for any Delivery Year if the Capacity Market Seller demonstrates that the MOPR Screened Generation Resource satisfies the following criterion:											
the resource was procured in a program in compliance with a state mandated renewable portfolio standard prior to December 31, 2018, or based on a request for proposals (RFP) issued under such a program prior to December 31, 2018.	х	x	х	х	х	х	х	х	х		
or satisfies all of the following criteria:											
the resource complies with the requirements of a state mandated renewable portfolio standard or voluntary renewable portfolio standard;	x	x	х	X	X	х	х	х	x	х	х
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning that (1) the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources, (2) both new and existing resources may participate, (3) all suppliers of renewable resources may participate, (4) the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent, (5) the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, (6) the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity, (7) the program terms do not use any locational requirement, e.g. offshore wind, other than restricting imports from other states, and (8) the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources;	Existing get additional mulipliers based on install date, offshore wind	ZECs, Zero Emission Facility's are nuclear power	Offshore Wind	Incumbents can receive credit multipliers	Offshore Wind	Combined heat & power	k X	x	х	Combined heat & power, nuclear, coal bed methane, clean coal	x
if the program does not use an auction, the terms of such program: (1) are consistent with fair market value and standard industry practice, and (2) provide that the price paid for renewable energy credits is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	х	x	х	х	х	х	Х	х	х	х	х
if the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning (1) winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), (2) payments to winners based on auction clearing price, and (3) at least three nonaffiliated sellers participate.											

Revised 3	Delaware		Illinois		Tier I (Carve Outs Maryland		North Carolina	Ohio	Pennsylvania	Washington DC
A Capacity Market Seller may qualify a MOPR Screened Generation Resource for an RPS Exemption in any RPM Auction for any Delivery Year if the Capacity Market Seller demonstrates that the MOPR Screened Generation Resource satisfies the following criterion:	Solar	Solar	Wind	Distributed Generation	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar	Solar
the resource was procured in a program in compliance with a state mandated renewable portfolio standard prior to December 31, 2018, or based on a request for proposals (RFP) issued under such a program prior to December 31, 2018.	х	x	X	х	х	х	x	х	x	x
or satisfies all of the following criteria:										
the resource complies with the requirements of a state mandated renewable portfolio standard or voluntary renewable portfolio standard;	x	x	х	х	X	x	x	х	х	X
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning that (1) the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources, (2) both new and existing resources may participate, (3) all suppliers of renewable resources may participate, (4) the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent, (5) the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, (6) the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity, (7) the program terms do not use any locational requirement, e.g. offshore wind, other than restricting imports from other states, and (8) the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources;	Existing get additional multipliers based on install date	X	х	X	X	X	X	Х	X	X
if the program does not use an auction, the terms of such program: (1) are consistent with fair market value and standard industry practice, and (2) provide that the price paid for renewable energy credits is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	х	X	X	X	Х	X	х	X	х	х
if the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning (1) winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), (2) payments to winners based on auction clearing price, and (3) at least three nonaffiliated sellers participate.										

Revised 3	Tier II							
	Maryland	New Jersey	North Carolina	Pennsylvania	Washington DC			
A Capacity Market Seller may qualify a MOPR Screened Generation Resource for an RPS Exemption in any RPM Auction for any Delivery Year if the Capacity Market Seller demonstrates that the MOPR Screened Generation Resource satisfies the following criterion:	Tier II	Tier II	Swine and Poultry Waste	Tier II	Tier II			
the resource was procured in a program in compliance with a state mandated renewable portfolio standard prior to December 31, 2018, or based on a request for proposals (RFP) issued under such a program prior to December 31, 2018.	x	x	х	х	х			
or satisfies all of the following criteria:								
the resource complies with the requirements of a state mandated renewable portfolio standard or voluntary renewable portfolio standard;	X	x	х	х	х			
the terms of such program are competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning that (1) the program requires LSEs to procure a defined amount of renewable resources, (2) both new and existing resources may participate, (3) all suppliers of renewable resources may participate, (4) the requirements of the program are fully objective and transparent, (5) the program terms do not include selection criteria that could give preference to new or existing resources, (6) the program terms do not use indirect means to discriminate against new or existing capacity, (7) the program terms do not use any locational requirement, e.g. offshore wind, other than restricting imports from other states, and (8) the renewable characteristic is the only screen for participation in the program where renewable does not include coal, natural gas or nuclear thermal resources;	t x	х	Very Specific	Waste coal, coal-mine methane, coal gasification	Restricts new entry, program ends 2020			
if the program does not use an auction, the terms of such program: (1) are consistent with fair market value and standard industry practice, and (2) provide that the price paid for renewable energy credits is determined by the contract terms between the seller and the buyer.	x	x	X	X	X			
if the program uses an auction, either as a means of procuring renewable attributes to meet state requirements, or as a means to facilitate the procurement of renewable attributes by responsible LSEs, such auction must be competitive and non-discriminatory, meaning (1) winner(s) of auction based on lowest offer price(s), (2) payments to winners based on auction clearing price, and (3) at least three nonaffiliated sellers participate.								