# Update on Default MSOC Proposal: Back Cast with Historic Prices and Net CONE 

Paul M. Sotkiewicz, Ph.D.
April 11, 2022
RASTF

## Overview and Context

- This presentation is in response to requests for a back cast on the MSOC proposed by E-Cubed that is the variant on Net CONE*B.
- Question is to look at historic PAH/PAI, Net CONE, and Prices to see if the marginal offer may have been reviewed.
- Note, E-Cubed does not endorse the idea that marginal offers must be reviewed.
- But for some exceptions, the IMM has noted RPM BRA outcomes have been competitive but for a few bad actors
- Conclusion: Back cast shows that the proposed method would, in most LDAs, results in the marginal offers having been reviewed.
- Exceptions are in EMAAC (PS) and SWMAAC (BGE \& Pepco) which transmission limited, but have cleared with larger (MAAC) LDA.


## RTO-Wide PAH

- There have been no PAH in the RTO-wide area since 2013/2014 DY.
- Through today, only 3.8 PAH on average since 2011/2012
- PAH in sub regions of RTO are additive to the RTO value.



## Mid-Atlantic \&

## Dominion

- More hours in this subregion as it includes RTO-wide and PAH for Mid Atl-Dom only.
- Since 2011/2012, the current PAH is 5.72 PAH to date.
- Mid-Atl-Dom wide since 2013/2014

Mid Atlantic \& Dom Performance Assessment Hours Since 2011/2012 (Includes RTO-wide PAH since Mid AtI \& Dom is a Subregion of RTO)

$$
60
$$



## Zonal Alone PAH events on Average Since 2011/2012

|  | Average PAH since <br> 2011/2012 |
| :--- | ---: |
| Zone | 2.454545 |
| BGE | 1.454545 |
| Pepco | 0.6 |
| Dominion | 0.818182 |
| ComEd | 2.454545 |
| AEP | 1.909091 |
| ATSI | 0.818182 |
| AE | 0.363636 |

- These hours would be additive to the PAH or the wider parent LDA/zone in which the transmission zone resides.
- For example, AEP and ATSI would be added to RTO-wide, increasing the "risk" of PAH
- AEP $2.45+$ RTO $3.82=6.27$ PAH
- ATSI 1.91 + RTO $3.82=5.73$ PAH
- However, BGE and Pepco are in MidAtl
- BGE 2.45 + MidAtl $5.73=8.28$ PAH


## Historic CP Clearing Prices by LDA

|  | RTO | MAAC | EMAAC | SWMAAC | PS | PS NORTH | $\begin{gathered} \text { DPL } \\ \text { SOUTH } \end{gathered}$ | PEPCO | ATSI | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ATSI- } \\ & \text { CLEVELAN } \\ & \text { D } \end{aligned}$ | COMED | BGE | PL | DAYTON | DEOK |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 16/17 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | \$134.00 | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| 17/18 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | \$151.50 | ** | ** |
| 18/19 | \$164.77 | \$164.77 | \$225.42 | \$164.77 | \$225.42 | \$225.42 | \$225.42 | \$164.77 | \$164.77 | \$164.77 | \$215.00 | \$164.77 | \$164.77 | ** | ** |
| 19/20 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 | \$119.77 | \$100.00 | \$119.77 | \$119.77 | \$119.77 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 | \$202.77 | \$100.30 | \$100.00 | ** | ** |
| 20/21 | \$76.53 | \$86.04 | \$187.87 | \$86.04 | \$187.87 | \$187.87 | \$187.87 | \$86.04 | \$76.53 | \$76.53 | \$188.12 | \$86.04 | \$86.04 | \$76.53 | \$130.00 |
| 21/22 | \$140.00 | \$140.00 | \$165.73 | \$140.00 | \$204.29 | \$204.29 | \$165.73 | \$140.00 | \$171.33 | \$171.33 | \$195.55 | \$200.30 | \$140.00 | \$140.00 | 140.00 |
| 22/23 | \$50.00 | \$95.79 | \$97.86 | \$95.79 | \$97.86 | \$97.86 | \$97.86 | \$95.79 | \$50.00 | \$50.00 | \$68.96 | \$126.50 | \$95.79 | \$50.00 | \$71.69 |
| 23/24 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## Historic Net CONE by LDA

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | DPL |  |  | ATSICLEVELAN |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | RTO | MAAC | EMAAC | SWMAAC | PS | PS NORTH | SOUTH | PEPCO | ATSI | D | COMED | BGE | PL | DAYTON | DEOK |
| 16/17 | \$330.53 | \$276.90 | \$329.94 | \$276.90 | \$329.94 | \$329.94 | \$329.94 | \$276.90 | \$362.64 | \$362.64 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17/18 | \$351.39 | \$313.00 | \$365.87 | \$313.00 | \$365.87 | \$365.87 | \$365.87 | \$313.00 | \$373.75 | \$373.75 | \$373.75 | \$313.00 | \$354.46 |  |  |
| 18/19 | \$300.57 | \$271.67 | \$284.82 | \$243.17 | \$297.99 | \$297.99 | \$258.32 | \$250.74 | \$271.72 | \$271.72 | \$320.29 | \$235.59 | \$284.79 |  |  |
| 19/20 | \$299.30 | \$262.02 | \$283.63 | \$229.93 | \$303.30 | \$303.30 | \$262.27 | \$244.23 | \$264.06 | \$264.06 | \$328.44 | \$215.62 | \$277.74 |  |  |
| 20/21 | \$292.95 | \$252.40 | \$283.10 | \$202.43 | \$306.92 | \$306.92 | \$254.97 | \$226.53 | \$261.17 | \$261.17 | \$329.81 | \$178.33 | \$267.33 | \$273.14 | \$282.46 |
| 21/22 | \$321.57 | \$292.69 | \$313.77 | \$264.88 | \$330.61 | \$330.61 | \$300.18 | \$285.42 | \$306.87 | \$306.87 | \$344.36 | \$244.33 | \$300.72 | \$312.56 | \$312.80 |
| 22/23 | \$260.50 | \$245.12 | \$259.36 | \$242.95 | \$268.44 | \$268.44 | \$236.18 | \$259.52 | \$230.50 | \$230.50 | \$247.86 | \$226.37 | \$250.41 | \$226.32 | \$223.63 |
| 23/24 | \$274.96 | \$275.08 | \$291.36 | \$244.72 | \$299.61 | \$299.61 | \$264.91 | \$270.00 | \$263.07 | \$263.07 | \$284.97 | \$219.44 | \$279.52 | \$246.93 | \$252.63 |

## Implied MSOC under Proposed Method Looking Back



## CP Price - MSOC

Positive value implies marginal offer would have been reviewed Based only on RTO or Mid-Atl \& Dom values for average PAH only Zonal specific differences not shown.

ATSI-
CLEVELAN
RTO MAAC EMAAC SWMAAC PS PS NORTH SOUTH PEPCO ATSI D D COMED BGE PL DAYTON DEOK
$6.8079-4.0668 \quad 86.803313 .7724978 .2995678 .2995696 .84571 \quad 5.1687914 .3715414 .37154109 .625222 .37619-9.3968111 .5226862 .77452$ $76.2219552 .9247372 .38343 \quad 61.1982105 .9335105 .933576 .4264555 .08755110 .4675110 .4675127 .2519127 .6118 \quad 50.535878 .0089377 .96133$ $19.000547 .1745346 .4202747 .6049244 .619444 .619451 .0176344 .31853 \quad 22.5705 \quad 22.570539 .4646681 .6032846 .1253523 .0679245 .07803$

